Beyond uneven development

Patrick Bond
University of KwaZulu-Natal
School of Development Studies and Centre for Civil Society, Durban
presented to the conference "Rethinking Development"
Cornell University Department of Development Sociology
Ithaca, 12 November 2011
cartoons by Zapiro

Theory, evidence, resistance, water, AIDS drugs, climate

Patrick Bond
University of KwaZulu-Natal
School of Development Studies and Centre for Civil Society, Durban
presented to the conference "Rethinking Development"
Cornell University Department of Development Sociology
Ithaca, 12 November 2011
cartoons by Zapiro

uneven development of
- society,
- sector,
- space,
- scale,
- sustainability
amplified during capitalist crisis, financialization

Durban’s COP17
'Conference of Polluters'
28 Nov-9 Dec 2011
International Convention Centre

Rudolf Heberle,
Louisiana State Univ.
Ferdinand Toennies,
Kiel Univ.

'circuit of capital': where flows go and why

http://davidharvey.org

David Harvey
The Crises of Capitalism
26 April 2013

‘overaccumulation’ and GDP stagnation: symptom of decline - finance-adjusted US profits

Source: Gerard Dumenil and Dominique Levy

Crisis of surplus value extraction

Temporal fix

Spatial fix

http://davidharvey.org

Fig. 1: The tenets of relation between the primary, secondary, and tertiary
Ugandan Marxist Dani Nabudere’s ‘financialization’ thesis vindicated

The Crash of International Finance Capital and The Rise and Fall of Money Capital

context: US economy as core site of overaccumulation and financialisation

limits of the ‘spatial fix’: amplified uneven development

limits of ‘temporal fix’: uncontrolled financial markets

‘stalling’: within finance, a deflationary melt, or an inflationary devalorization of fictitious capital?

‘stealing’: exploitation of capitalist/non-capitalist relations

Rosa Luxemburg

‘Accumulation of capital periodically bursts out in crises and spurs capital on to a continual extension of the market. Capital cannot accumulate without the aid of non-capitalist organisations, nor can it tolerate their continued existence side by side with itself. Only the continuous and progressive disintegration of non-capitalist organisations makes accumulation of capital possible.’
The Accumulation of Capital, 1919.

Shock Doctrine by Naomi Klein (and Milton Friedman)

extra-economic coercion is vital for neoliberalism according to Friedman (advisor to Pinochet after 9/11/73 coup in Chile): ‘only a crisis – actual or perceived – produces real change’

Chile: ‘the most extreme capitalist makeover ever attempted anywhere... “Chicago School” revolution, as so many of Pinochet’s economists had studied under Friedman there. He coined a phrase for this painful tactic: “Shock treatment”’

A closer look at Marx’s description of primitive accumulation reveals a wide range of processes. These include:

- the commodification and privatization of land and the forcible expulsion of peasant populations;
- conversion of various forms of property rights (common, collective, state, etc.) into exclusive private property rights;
- suppression of rights to the commons;
- commodification of labour power and the suppression of alternative (indigenous) forms of production and consumption;
- colonial, neocolonial and imperial processes of appropriation of assets (including natural resources);
- monetization of exchange and taxation (particularly of land);
- slave trade;
- usury, the national debt and ultimately the credit system as radical means of primitive accumulation.

‘articulation of modes of production’

Harold Wolpe’s

‘It is the logic of uneven development which structures the context for this articulation’

uneven and combined development

Smith: ‘it is the logic of uneven development which structures the context for this articulation’

in SA race-class-gender debate,

in SA race-class-gender debate, Harold Wolpe’s ‘articulation of modes of production’

David Harvey

‘primitive accumulation’

‘accumulation by dispossession’

A closer look at Marx’s description of primitive accumulation reveals a wide range of processes. These include:

- the commodification and privatization of land and the forcible expulsion of peasant populations;
- conversion of various forms of property rights (common, collective, state, etc.) into exclusive private property rights;
- suppression of rights to the commons;
- commodification of labour power and the suppression of alternative (indigenous) forms of production and consumption;
- colonial, neocolonial and imperial processes of appropriation of assets (including natural resources);
- monetization of exchange and taxation (particularly of land);
- slave trade;
- usury, the national debt and ultimately the credit system as radical means of primitive accumulation.


The Limits of Capitalism

Shocking: Temporal Fix - “stalling” and spatial fix - “shifting”

“Shifting”: volatility and uneven geographical development inexorably worsen

(IMF, Global Financial Stability Report, April 2010)

Source: IMF, Global Financial Stability Report April 2010

‘shifting’:

volatility and uneven geographical development

‘stalling’:

within finance, a deflationary melt, or an inflationary devalorization of fictitious capital?

‘stealing’:

exploitation of capitalist/non-capitalist relations

The Accumulation of Capital, 1919.

Source: Unctad 2009

The full extent of the financial crisis has yet to be revealed. The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are now clearly visible.

The limits of the ‘temporal fix’ have become obvious too.

The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are amplified by the limits of the ‘temporal fix’.

‘shifting’:

volatility and uneven geographical development

‘stalling’:

within finance, a deflationary melt, or an inflationary devalorization of fictitious capital?

‘stealing’:

exploitation of capitalist/non-capitalist relations

The Accumulation of Capital, 1919.

Source: Unctad 2009

The Limits of Capitalism

Shocking: Temporal Fix - “stalling” and spatial fix - “shifting”

“Shifting”: volatility and uneven geographical development inexorably worsen

(IMF, Global Financial Stability Report, April 2010)

Source: IMF, Global Financial Stability Report April 2010

‘shifting’:

volatility and uneven geographical development

‘stalling’:

within finance, a deflationary melt, or an inflationary devalorization of fictitious capital?

‘stealing’:

exploitation of capitalist/non-capitalist relations

The Accumulation of Capital, 1919.

Source: Unctad 2009

The full extent of the financial crisis has yet to be revealed. The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are now clearly visible.

The limits of the ‘temporal fix’ have become obvious too.

The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are amplified by the limits of the ‘temporal fix’.

‘shifting’:

volatility and uneven geographical development

‘stalling’:

within finance, a deflationary melt, or an inflationary devalorization of fictitious capital?

‘stealing’:

exploitation of capitalist/non-capitalist relations

The Accumulation of Capital, 1919.

Source: Unctad 2009

The full extent of the financial crisis has yet to be revealed. The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are now clearly visible.

The limits of the ‘temporal fix’ have become obvious too.

The limits of the ‘spatial fix’ are amplified by the limits of the ‘temporal fix’.
combined development

• Trotsky: ‘From the universal law of unevenness thus derives another law which for want of a better name, we may call the law of combined development – by which we mean a drawing together of the different stages of the journey, a combining of separate steps, an amalgam of archaic with more contemporary forms.

• Neil Davidson: ‘The archaic and the modern had melded or fused in all aspects of these social formations, from the organisation of arms production to the structure of religious observance, in entirely new and unstable ways.

‘It is tempting to describe these as mutations, except that the inadequacy of the language led Trotsky to reject the metaphors drawn from human biology in which stages of development had been described from the Enlightenment to the Third International in its Stalinist phase.’

uneven development: roots

in ‘private production’ among different producers within the same community: differences of aptitude between individuals, the differences of fertility between animals or soils, innumerable accidents of human life or the cycle of nature

uneven and combined development

• Trotsky: ‘From the universal law of unevenness thus derives another law which for want of a better name, we may call the law of combined development – by which we mean a drawing together of the different stages of the journey, a combining of separate steps, an amalgam of archaic with more contemporary forms.

• Neil Davidson: ‘The archaic and the modern had melded or fused in all aspects of these social formations, from the organisation of arms production to the structure of religious observance, in entirely new and unstable ways.

‘It is tempting to describe these as mutations, except that the inadequacy of the language led Trotsky to reject the metaphors drawn from human biology in which stages of development had been described from the Enlightenment to the Third International in its Stalinist phase.’

uneven development of society, sector, space, scale, sustainability

a matter of structure and struggle

beyond uneven development:

Polanyi’s double movement

The Great Transformation (1947): ‘the extension of the market organisation in respect to genuine commodities was accompanied by its restriction’

our context - Fanon on nationalist elites:

Can global governance (G8/G20, IMF/World Bank) and African elites (African Union, NEPAD) do this work?

The national bourgeoisie will be quite content with the role of the Western bourgeoisie’s business agent, and it will play its part without any complexes in a most dignified manner... In its beginnings, the national bourgeoisie of the colonial country identifies itself with the decadence of the bourgeoisie of the West. We need not think that it is jumping ahead: it is in fact beginning at the end. It is already settled before it has come to know the petulance, the refinements, or the will to succeed of youth.

Frantz Fanon, ‘Wretched of the Earth’
**South Africa’s right to water?**

- Everyone has the right to an environment that is not harmful to their health or well-being...
- Everyone has the right to have access to... sufficient water

• 2003-09 lawsuit by Soweto activists and Coalition Against Water Privatisation (CAWP) against Johannesburg government (and by implication, Paris-based Suez): http://www.law.wits.ac.za/cals

---

**Two core aspects of Mazibuko v Johannesburg case**

- **How much water?**
  - City of Joburg and Suez (2001): 25 litres/capita/day
  - Phil activists, CAWP, CALS (2003): 50 l/cap
  - High Court (Tsaka in April 2008): 50 l/cap
  - Constitutional Court (Oct 2009): ‘we don’t DO policy’

- **What delivery mechanism?**
  - Joburg, Suez: pre-payment meters
  - Phil et al: credit meters (as in white areas)
  - High Court: pre-payment meters are discriminatory
  - ConCourt: no problem with pre-payment meters

---

**Lessons from Mazibuko for transcending uneven development**

- A broader commons framing, including Rights of Nature
- Use human rights narrative purely for defensive purposes (injunctions against disconnections), not to change policy (confirming Critical Legal Studies’ ‘contingency’ theory)
- Use rights narrative for social education and mobilisation (Treatment Action Campaign) but beware demobilisation potential
- For real relief: reconnection, turning meters into ‘statues’, ‘commoning’ and mutual aid, social mobilization and protest
case study #2 of transcending uneven development: successful local/internationalist social movement solidarity for access to Anti-RetroViral drugs

- 1990s – US promotes Intellectual Property above all, monopoly patented ARVs cost $15 000/person/year
- 1997 – SA’s Medicines Act allows ‘compulsory licensing’
- 1999 – Al Gore for president, ACTUP! opposition, Seattle WTO protest and Bill Clinton surrender
- 2000 – AIDS Durban conference, Thabo Mbeki denialism
- 2001 – ‘PMA-SA v Mandela’ lawsuit w MSF & Oxfam, while TAC imports Thai, Brazilian, Indian generics

TAC’s Anti-RetroVirals campaign successes:
- 2001 – Constitutional Court supports nevirapine, major WTO TRIPS concession at Doha
- 2002 – critiques of Mbeki, Manto Tshabalala-Msimang
- 2003 – ANC compels change in state policy
- 2004 – generics produced in SA
- 2009 – nearly 800 000 public sector recipients
- 2010-11 threats – fiscal austerity, Obama’s PEPFAR cuts beyond uneven development

I sympathise with those who would minimise, rather than with those who would maximise, economic entanglement among nations. Ideas, knowledge, science, hospitality, travel - these are the things which should of their nature be international. But let goods be homespun whenever it is reasonably and conveniently possible and, above all, let finance be primarily national. — John Maynard Keynes (1933), ‘National Self-Sufficiency’, Yale Review

little/no progress with global governance: top-down failures in economics, politics, environment

Montreal Protocol banning CFCs, 1987 but since then:  
- Kyoto Protocol 1997 and aftermath – Copenhagen Accord a climate disaster  
- World Bank, IMF Annual Meetings: trivial reforms - China rising, Africa falling  
- Post-Washington Consensus: rhetoric since 1998  
- UN MDG strategies, 2000 – in 2012 Sustainable Dev G’s  
- WTO Doha Agenda 2001: failure  
- renewed war in S.Asia, Middle East, 2001-?  
- UN Security Council Reform 2005  
- G8 promises on aid, NEPAD/APRM, Gleneagles: broken

Copenhagen Accord, COP 15, December 2009

- Jacob Zuma (SA)  
- Lula da Silva (Brazil)  
- Barack Obama (USA)  
- Wen Jiabao (China)  
- Manmohan Singh (India)  

world’s biggest polluter

Beyond the uneven development of scale: ‘globalize people, deglobalize capital’

I sympathise with those who would minimise, rather than with those who would maximise, economic entanglement among nations. Ideas, knowledge, science, hospitality, travel - these are the things which should of their nature be international. But let goods be homespun whenever it is reasonably and conveniently possible and, above all, let finance be primarily national. — John Maynard Keynes (1933), ‘National Self-Sufficiency’, Yale Review

Beyond the uneven development of scale:  
Commoning intellectual property  
Decommodification  
Destratification  
Deglobalisation of capital  
Globalisation of solidarity

Case study #3 of resisting uneven development: climate

A TIMELINE TO REDUCE EMISSIONS?? NOT UNTIL THERE’S MORE EVIDENCE OF GLOBAL CLIMATE CHANGE

A GIFT FROM THE CORPORATE WORLD!

The world’s biggest polluter

Indigenous Peoples’ Guide: False Solutions to Climate Change

Don’t be fooled!
False Solutions: technology
- dirty ‘clean energy’: nuclear, ‘clean coal’, fracking shale gas, hydropower, hydrogen;
- biofuels, biomass, biochar;
- Carbon Capture and Storage; and
- other whacky geoengineering gimmicks (Genetically Modified trees; sulfates in the air to shut out the sun; iron filings in the sea to create algae blooms; artificial microbes to convert plant biomass into fuels, chemicals and products; large-scale solar reflection e.g. desert plastic-wrap)

Payment for ‘Environmental Services’?
- ecosystems useful to humans:
  - Storage of carbon by soils, vegetation, and oceans,
  - Habitats for plants, animals, and microorganisms,
  - Filtering of fresh water, and even
  - Aesthetic or spiritual significance of landscapes
- source: Kathy McAfee, SF State University

Payment for ‘Environmental Services’?
Compensating the poor and other land users for practices that maintain healthy, ‘service-producing’ ecosystems may be an important part of strategies for sustainable and equitable development. Serious problems arise, however, when such compensation schemes are framed as markets.
- Kathy McAfee, SF State University

main False Solution: global carbon market core to multilateral climate governance

lead US climate negotiator Todd Stern, on demand for recognising climate debt?
‘The sense of guilt or culpability or reparations – I just categorically reject that’
Stern thus rejects core principle: ‘polluter pays’

© WikiLeaks revealed (Feb 10) Stern/Pershing bribery and bullying: Ethiopia, Maldives, Bolivia, Ecuador

who owes? who caused climate change?

who loses from climate change?

Green Climate Fund – $100bn/year by 2020 (promised), co-chaired by SA’s Trevor Manuel
• $100 billion isn’t enough!
• direct access? ‘Basic Income Grants’ preferable to corrupt ‘aid’ (Manuel opposed)
• False Solutions to be funded
• Manuel wants carbon trade to provide 50% of GCF revenue
• World Bank is interim GCF trustee despite terrible record of managing climate and development funding
Should the World Bank be lead climate financier?
- fossil fuel loans: $6.3 billion in 2009-10 year, up from $1.6 to $3.4 billion in 2006-07;
- commodity export financing;
- resource curse financing;
- Robert Zoellick qualifications:
  - WB prez after Wolfowitz was fired
  - Goldman Sachs int ‘l banker, 2006-7
  - US State Dep #2, 2005-6
  - US Trade Rep to WTO, 2001-5
  - Enron’s senior political advisor, 1999-2000
  - neocon Project for a New American Century founder, 1998
  - Fannie Mae #2, 1993-
  - Presidential deputy chief of staff to George Bush Sr, 1992
  - US Treasury: Deputy Assistant Secretary during S&L crash, 1980s

Cancun COP 16 revived market fix
- in spite of market’s corruption, fraud, stagnation and speculation
- in short, capital’s next spatio-temporal financial fix ($3 trillion commodity market) plus accumulation by dispossession: shifting, stalling and stealing
- breaks everything he touches

EU carbon trading work effectively?
- emissions market’s five major crashes, 2006-09, 2010 stagnation, 2011 theft-closure, 2012 denouement?
- does EU carbon trading work effectively?
- new rising carbon trading look in the South
- Plantar’s green desert timber plantation
- alien-invasive trees grow 10 years, then die and become charcoal for pig-iron, for Brazilian auto industry

Reducing emissions through deforestation and forest degradation
- new critique of carbon trading: www.storyofcapandtrade.org
- Durban Group for Climate Justice
- introducing: Durban Group for Climate Justice
- October 2004 initiative supported by Dag Hammarskjold Foundation, Sweden
- driven by grassroots activists in India, Brazil, Thailand, South Africa, etc
- largest signatory: Friends of the Earth International
- key sites: The Cornerhouse, FEARN, SEEN, CarbonTrade Watch, CDM Watch, Dartmouth Univ Environmental Studies, UKZN Centre for Civil Society

Carbon trading gimmick:
- in 1997, US vice-president Al Gore (later a carbon trader) pushed for Kyoto to include emissions markets, in exchange for Washington’s promised support ... promise soon broken
- ‘The European Union has adopted this US innovation and is making it work effectively there.’
- (On Inconvenient Truth, p. 233)
- REDD-type projects have already caused land grabs, killings, violent evictions and forced displacement, violations of human rights, threats to cultural survival, militarization and servitude.’
- Tom Goldtooth, Indigenous Environmental Network

Reductions of REDD reforms:
- no chance of getting full indigenous rights (e.g. free, prior and informed consent)
- no chance to keep REDD out of carbon markets and offsets
- no chance to win on definitional issues (plantations are not forests)
- highly divisive within indigenous peoples

Critiques of REDD reforms:
- no chance of getting full indigenous rights (e.g. free, prior and informed consent)
- no chance to keep REDD out of carbon markets and offsets
- no chance to win on definitional issues (plantations are not forests)
- highly divisive within indigenous peoples
What is ‘climate justice’?

Core principles from Rights of Mother Earth conference, Cochabamba, Bolivia (April 2010):

- 50 percent reduction of greenhouse gas emissions by 2020
- Stabilising temperature rises to 1°C and 350 parts per million

- Acknowledging the climate debt owed by developed countries (6% of GDP)
- Full respect for human rights and the inherent rights of indigenous people
- Universal declaration of Mother Earth rights to ensure harmony with nature
- Establishment of an International Court of Climate Justice

- Rejection of carbon markets, and REDD’s commodified nature and forests
- Promotion of change, upholding patterns of developed countries
- End of intellectual property rights for climate technologies

Vital need for ‘Million Climate Jobs’ campaign, so metalworkers get ‘Just Transition’: Guaranteed, well-paid jobs in public/community renewable sector that help society and save the planet.

http://www.climatejobs.org.za

CJ movement: leave the oil in the soil, the coal in the hole, the tarsand in the land, and the fracking shale-gas in our earth’s ass.
activist ideas to culture-jam the Conference of Polluters

Robert Zoellick

Climate Justice Now!SA opposes emissions, privatised electricity, Eskom coal and nuclear, carbon trading: demands conservation/renewables and electricity-as-a-right to avoid this danger.