Can the ‘Green’ Climate Fund(s) provide appropriate finance to Africa? Carbon Capitalists & Climate Justice Movements

Dr. M. K. Dorsey - Wesleyan University, College of the Environment
University of KwaZulu-Natal • 20 August 2012
(with Dr. Sarah Bracking • Manchester University • School of Environment & Development)
FOUR FOCAL AREAS

1) The Green Climate Fund itself is badly designed because of flaws in its governance structure and likely operating effects;

2) The Green Climate Fund is of a particular generic type, existing as a pooled equity fund using development finance and private investors. It has the same design as previous climate finance funds which have had little impact, such that we deduce that it is the type of instrument which is the problem;

3) Financialised solutions to climate change are generically misplaced (§ shifting-stalling-stealing), since this is one policy area, among others, where financial markets and financiers can have little positive effect; &

(4) Implications for the politics of climate justice in the context of failed supranational environmental governance.
FOUR FOCAL AREAS

1) The **Green Climate Fund & Climate Finance is badly designed** because of flaws in its governance structure and likely operating effects;

2) The Green Climate Fund is of a particular generic type, existing as a pooled equity fund using development finance and private investors. It has the same design as previous climate finance funds which have had little impact, such that we deduce that it is the type of instrument which is the problem;

3) **Financialised solutions to climate change are generically misplaced (§ shifting-stalling-stealing),** since this is one policy area, among others, where financial markets and financiers can have little positive effect; &

(4) **Implications for the politics of climate justice** in the context of failed supranational environmental governance.
~4 Objectives Today •

**ABCs of 21st Century Climate Policy**

- **(Review Methods):** How a to investigate climate policy, carbon trading and responses.  
  - Merging Discursive & Empirical Methods)

- (A) Elaborate ‘Green’ Climate Finance Structures.

- (B) Discuss what the **three (real) climate debates** means for expanding the conversation on **climate justice**.

- (C) Understand **the origins and limits** of --(hegemonic) market ideologies-- by mapping “**flexible mechanisms**”.

- (D) Elaborate **the nature of resistance** *(justice)* & role of **institutions** in the pre- & post-2012 world.
Methods & Goals:
Towards an Ethnography of Climate Policy
METHODS

Towards an Ethnography of CO2 Markets

- **Sustained Participant Observation** (since 2004, Buenos Aires COP10 to present/2011 Durban COP17)

- **Case Studies Bound By (Multi-site) Ethnographic Field Work** (at COPs, with affected communities, on CDM sites, etc.)

- **Archival Research** (UNCED, pre-Kyoto)

- **Discourse Analysis** of carbon market participants

- **Semi-Structured Interviews** of market-makers, lesser participants, regulators, inter alia

- **Studying Up** …Competitive Intelligence Research
EXPANDING L. Nader…

COMPETITIVE INTELLIGENCE RESEARCH (CIR)

(1) Conduct basic literature searches on CO2 market actors;

(2) Acquire public records and web-based information (e.g., monitoring and tracking actor web sites);

(3) Target, seek out, & query CO2 universe: industry, NGO & government observers;

(4) Interact & Interview targeted leaders (i.e., CEOs & Presidents at COPs, etc.) & data gathering from open sources (speeches, trade meetings, COP/MOP, etc.);

(5) Visit sites (trading floors, COP/MOP, research institutes, plus other facilities and sites utilized by CO2 market actors; &

(6) Develop targeted ‘CO2 market actor’-informant relationships.
SAMPLE OF DATA GATHERED, …for a COP

Electronic Correspondence as function of Epistemic Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EPISTEMIC COMMUNITY</th>
<th>NUMBER SINGULAR EMAILS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions of higher learning/Learned Societies</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalists</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-governmental organizations</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis Students</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL: 62

Interviews -->

TOTAL: 213

(from more than 3000)

<-- Correspondence

Interviews Divided by Epistemic Community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EPISTEMIC COMMUNITY</th>
<th>NUMBER of INTERVIEWS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions of higher learning/Learned Societies</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-governmental organizations</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Community</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL: 213
Mapping the market…

The Open Graph Viz Platform

Gephi is an interactive visualization and exploration platform for all kinds of networks and complex systems, dynamic and hierarchical graphs.

Runs on Windows, Linux and Mac OS X. Gephi is open-source and free.

Learn More on Gephi Platform »

Download FREE Gephi 0.8 alpha
Release Notes | System Requirements

Features
Quick start
Screenshots
Videos

Gephi has been accepted again for Google Summer of Code 2011! The program is the best way for students around the world to start contributing to an open-source project.

Learn More »
(A)

Climate Finance Architecture(s):

The Structural Crisis of Climate Capitalism

(-Shifting, Stalling, Stealing-)
What’s actually needed…?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACTS &amp; FIGURES: THE SIZE OF CURRENT CLIMATE FINANCE FLOWS COMPARED TO INVESTMENT NEEDS (US DOLLARS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>$10 trillion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: IMF, World Economic Outlook database, April 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$1.2 trillion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: IEA, Energy Technology Perspectives, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$243 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$100 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: Copenhagen Accord, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$97 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: CPI Report, 2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(We’ll come back to this later.)
FOUR FOCAL AREAS

1) The Green Climate Fund itself is badly designed because of flaws in its governance structure and likely operating effects;

2) The Green Climate Fund is of a particular generic type, existing as a pooled equity fund using development finance and private investors. It has the same design as previous climate finance funds which have had little impact, such that we deduce that it is the type of instrument which is the problem;

3) Financialised solutions to climate change are generically misplaced (§ shifting-stalling-stealing), since this is one policy area, among others, where financial markets and financiers can have little positive effect; &

4) Implications for the politics of climate justice in the context of failed supranational environmental governance.
### Government Agencies, Development Banks, and Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFD</td>
<td>French Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AusAID</td>
<td>Australian Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMZ</td>
<td>Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCPO</td>
<td>Climate Change Projects Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIDA</td>
<td>Canadian International Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union REDD Facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ex-Im</td>
<td>Export-Import Bank of the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FFEM</td>
<td>French Global Environment Facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCCA</td>
<td>Global Climate Change Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German Technical Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JBC</td>
<td>Japan Bank of International Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japan International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KFW</td>
<td>German Development Bank (KFW)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIES</td>
<td>Interministerial Taskforce on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOFA</td>
<td>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORAD</td>
<td>Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODIN</td>
<td>Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPIC</td>
<td>Overseas Private Investment Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECP</td>
<td>Africa-EU Renewable Energy Cooperation Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>U.S. Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Multilateral Funds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AF</td>
<td>Adaptation Fund (GEF acts as secretariat and World Bank as trustee)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APCF</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Carbon Fund (hosted by ADB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBFF</td>
<td>Congo Basin Forest Fund (hosted by AfDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTF</td>
<td>Clean Technology Fund (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCPF</td>
<td>Forest Carbon Partnership Facility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIP</td>
<td>Forest Investment Program (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEERF</td>
<td>Global Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Fund (hosted by the EIB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDCF</td>
<td>Least Developed Countries Fund (hosted by the GEF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPCR</td>
<td>Pilot Program on Climate Resilience (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCCF</td>
<td>Special Climate Change Fund (hosted by the GEF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCF</td>
<td>Strategic Climate Fund (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SREP</td>
<td>Scaling-Up Renewable Energy Program (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### UN and Regional Agencies, Other Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AfDB</td>
<td>African Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AsDB</td>
<td>Asian Development Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIF</td>
<td>Climate Investment Funds (implemented through World Bank, ADB, AfDB, EBRD, and IDB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBRD</td>
<td>European Bank for Reconstruction and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIF</td>
<td>European Investment Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEP</td>
<td>United Nations Environment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNREDD</td>
<td>United Nations Collaborative Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 2. Current climate finance flows (USD billion)

Source: Climate Policy Initiative (CPI)

Notes: Figures presented are indicative estimates of annual flows for the latest year available, 2009/2010 (variable according to the data source). Figures are expressed in USD billion and are rounded to produce whole numbers. Estimates spanning multiple years are adjusted to produce annual-equivalent estimates. Where ranges of estimates are available, the mid-point is presented. All flows are ‘incremental’ except for those identified as full or partial ‘capital investment’. Most data presented relate to commitments in a given year, due to limited availability of disbursement data. “Estimated carbon pricing revenues indicated are not necessarily all appropriated for climate finance.
The 55%…

“…Out of the estimated USD 97 billion in global climate funding, on average USD 55 billion is provided by the private sector, while at least USD 21 billion is provided by public budgets…”

...Climate Finance Architecture’(s):
Structural Crisis of
Climate Capitalism
...Shifting...
What’s actually needed…to do what?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACTS &amp; FIGURES: THE SIZE OF CURRENT CLIMATE FINANCE FLOWS COMPARED TO INVESTMENT NEEDS (US DOLLARS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>$10 trillion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total annual investment needed in developing countries by 2015.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: IMF, World Economic Outlook database, April 2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$1.2 trillion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional annual investment by 2050 in energy supply and use to avoid a temperature increase beyond 2°C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: IEA, Energy Technology Perspectives, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$243 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global total investment in clean energy in 2010.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$100 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual amount of public and private finance pledged by developed countries to collectively support developing countries’ transitions to low-carbon futures by 2020.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: Copenhagen Accord, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>$97 billion</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current climate finance flows from developed to developing countries, including public and private finance and to a limited extent South-South and domestic sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source: CPI Report, 2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ice …

Arctic poised to see record low sea ice volume this year

May 13, 2010

Arctic Ice Volume Anomaly and Trend from PIOMAS

Anomaly Trend: -3.4 [1000 km$^3$/Decade]
Last Day: 2010-04-30

UPDATE: Two commenters pointed me to the Polar Science Center. They looks to have the best Arctic ice volume model around — and it’s been validated (see below).
(B)

3 (real?) Climate Debates ?
(I) “Climate Debate”

From the last day of

Durban • 2011

(http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JJF7Mm-Y-SM)
(II) Climate Debates Since Kyoto

Around 2 Questions:

(A) How Fast? &

(B) How Unjust?
Rephrased...

What are implications of (faster?) speeds of unfolding climate crisis for climate justice?
II (A)

JUST HOW FAST?

Some Ethnographic Data Findings
A late November 2008 meta-data report by the Public Interest Research Centre (PIRC) says:

“...critical climate [collapse] processes might have begun ... almost a century ahead of schedule...”

Ice ...
“…the ice, which has been a permanent feature for at least 100,000 years, is now so thin that almost all of it will disappear in about a decade.”

--Peter Wadhams, U. Cambridge • May 2009
High seas...

Sea levels are rising at up to 3cm per

The estimated sea levels are indicated by the black line (Dominguez et al. 2008), the yellow dotted line and the red dotted line (from satellite altimeter observations). Blue is estimate from individual contributions. Bottom indicates the timing of major volcanic eruptions.
Discursive/Ethnographic Data…

“Sea levels may rise 3 times faster than IPCC estimated, could hit 6 feet by 2100” --Jet Propulsion Lab Release, 8 March 2011

Or: “…if current ice sheet melting rates continue for the next four decades, their cumulative loss could raise sea level by 15 centimeters (5.9 inches) by 2050. When this is added to the predicted sea level contribution of 8 centimeters (3.1 inches) from glacial ice caps and 9 centimeters (3.5 inches) from ocean thermal expansion, total sea level rise could reach 32 centimeters (12.6 inches).”
Empirical Findings...

20 June 2011:

US-NSF: “Rate is greater now than at any time during past 2,100 years”
A late November 2008 meta-data report by the Public Interest Research Centre (PIRC) says:

“...critical climate [collapse] processes might have begun ... almost a century ahead of schedule...”

Happened in 2007…was to be 2050…

World carbon emissions

Billion metric tonnes of carbon

- China
- U.S.
- U.K.
- Canada
- India
- Japan
- Russia
- Germany

Source: U.S. Dept of Energy's Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center (CDIAC)

Reuters graphic/Catherine Treverthen - corrects trillion metric tonnes to billion

02/01/09
Two Questions

(A) How Fast? & now...

(B) How Unjust?
According to WORLD BANK & W.H.O.: All countries are vulnerable to climate change but the poorest countries and the poorest people within them are most vulnerable.

In this decade over 3 billion people in developing countries could be affected by climate related disasters.

People in developing countries are affected at 20 times the rate of those in developed countries.

Source: World Bank analysis based on CREDA data.
Maplecroft Climate Change Risk Report (2011)

22 African countries out of 28 across the world at ‘extreme risk’
UN Estimates Climate Change Risks as Concentrated Deaths: Africa & Global South

In 2000: 150,000 deaths per year
In 2009: 300,000 deaths per year
300 million already at risk from climate change
(III) Climate Debate
Since Kyoto,
Latest...
“...2ºC global warming would be a disaster scenario for much of humanity and many other species on the planet...”

Hansen and Sato 2012


Paleoclimate data help us assess climate sensitivity and potential human-made climate effects. We conclude that Earth in the warmest interglacial periods of the past million years was less than 1°C warmer than in the Holocene. Polar warmth in these interglacials and in the Pliocene does not imply that a substantial cushion remains between today’s climate and dangerous warming, but rather that Earth is poised to experience strong amplifying polar feedbacks in response to moderate global warming. Thus goals to limit human-made warming to 2°C are not sufficient — they are prescriptions for disaster. Ice sheet disintegration is nonlinear, spurred by amplifying feedbacks. We suggest that ice sheet mass loss, if warming continues unabated, will be characterized better by a doubling time for mass loss rate than by a linear trend. Satellite gravity data, though too brief to be conclusive, are consistent with a doubling time of 10 years or less, implying the possibility of multi-meter sea level rise this century. Observed accelerating ice sheet mass loss supports our conclusion that Earth’s temperature now exceeds the mean Holocene value. Rapid reduction of fossil fuel emissions is required for humanity to succeed in preserving a planet resembling the one on which civilization developed.

- Download PDF (831 kb)
- Go to book webpage
- Read related news release
- Read related science brief
- Included in "Proceedings of the Milutin Milankovitch 130th Anniversary Symposium". Document on GISS site is authors' submitted text.

Citation Styles
...Climate Finance Architecture’(s): Structural Crisis of Climate Capitalism ...Shifting...
What’s actually needed...to do what?

**FACTS & FIGURES: THE SIZE OF CURRENT CLIMATE FINANCE FLOWS COMPARED TO INVESTMENT NEEDS (US DOLLARS)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$10 trillion</td>
<td>Total annual investment needed in developing countries by 2015.</td>
<td>IMF, World Economic Outlook database, April 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1.2 trillion</td>
<td>Additional annual investment by 2050 in energy supply and use to avoid a temperature increase beyond 2°C.</td>
<td>IEA, Energy Technology Perspectives, 2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$100 billion</td>
<td>Annual amount of public and private finance pledged by developed countries to collectively support developing countries’ transitions to low-carbon futures by 2020.</td>
<td>Copenhagen Accord, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$97 billion</td>
<td>Current climate finance flows from developed to developing countries, including public and private finance and to a limited extent South-South and domestic sources.</td>
<td>CPI Report, 2011</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Climate Finance Architecture’(s): Structural Crisis of Climate Capitalism

...Stalling...
(C₁)

Market Ideologies & Maps
Kyoto Core Solution:

“Flexible Mechanisms”

**KP - Article 2 - “application of market instruments”**

**Art. 17 - “emissions trading”:**

“The Conference of the Parties shall define the relevant principles, modalities, rules and guidelines, in particular for verification, reporting and accountability for emissions trading.”
REDUX: 2 Key “Solutions” built on:

Markets Defined by:

Cap & Trade

Offset Schemes
Ethnographic Data (& Theory) Results...

• Why Market “solutions”/ideology?
Pre-crash ethnographic data…

“Carbon trading’s [and offsets] objective is to [quickly] **reduce the costs** of emissions reductions **for industrialised countries**.”

**Ken Newcombe**, World Bank Prototype Carbon Fund, Bonn, 6 June 2000
Pre-crash ethnographic data...

“So far, the European market has been a costly mistake...The Kyoto Protocol period is almost a lost decade.”

--Catrinus Jepma, Professor of Energy & Sustainability, University of Groningen, The Netherlands, 5 Nov. 2007
FRAUD PREDICTED IN 2007 (!)...

“If you are going to trade any commodity on the open market, you are creating a profit and loss situation. There will be fraudulent trading of carbon credits…In future, if you are running a factory and you desperately need credits to offset your emissions, there will be someone who can make that happen for you. Absolutely, organized crime will be involved.”

--Peter Younger, Interpol, told Reuters in an interview at a forestry conference in Nusa Dua on the Indonesian island of Bali, 2007
Early crash ethnographic data...

“I'm not at all convinced from what we've seen internationally that a cap and trade regime and a price on carbon is going to motivate investment in truly transformational technologies.”

“Carbon trading **may have been** the answer once but **not any more**... It will just take **too long** to achieve anything, and **we no longer have the luxury of time**.”

--Professor Kevin Anderson, 
Director of the UK’s Tyndall Centre for Climate Change Research, 
Discussion at the Royal Society, October 2008
Re-Meet the even newer still Ken Newcombe from later in 2008...

“We are thrilled to be trading on the CCFE [Chicago Climate Futures Exchange] and supporting the pioneering efforts of the Chicago Climate Exchange.”

-- Ken Newcombe, CEO of C-Quest Capital LLC, 19 November 2008.
Status Quo of “Core” Solution…

(A week before the Durban talks)
Spot Carbon Dioxide (CO2) Emissions EUA Price/Europe

EUETSSY1:IND 9.21000 ↓ 0.32000 3.36%

As of 11/18/2011. All times are ET. Market data is delayed by at least 15 minutes.

Snapshot for Spot Carbon Dioxide (CO2) Emissions EUA Price/Europe (EUETSSY1:IND)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Open</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.21000</td>
<td>9.21000</td>
<td>9.21000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rate Chart for EUETSSY1:IND

Most Popular News

1. Stocks, U.S. Futures Fall as Yen, Dollar Strengthen on Budget-Cuts Impasse
2. U.S. Supercommittee Ready to Announce Failure
3. Olympus’s $687 Million Takeover Scam Lay Hidden in Cardiff Filing System
4. Japan Exports Fall as China Sees World Slump
5. U.S. Supercommittee Ready to Announce Failure
>30% EUA Fall in last 2 quarters ‘2011…
UPDATE 3-UBS analysts predict 70 pct collapse in EU CO2 prices

Fri Nov 18, 2011 3:24pm GMT

* UBS says EU CO2 price call fall to 3 eur/t
* Deutsche Bank cuts 2011 EUA price outlook 25 pct to 9 eur/t
* UBS says oversupply in market won’t disappear until 2025
* UBS says carbon scheme “isn’t working” (Releads, adds CMIA response paragraph 6-8)

By Jeff Coelho

LONDON, Nov 18 (Reuters) - European Union carbon prices could shed some 70 percent from current levels, as the bloc struggles with a mounting debt crisis and a glut of supply in the carbon market is unlikely to disappear until 2025, analysts at UBS said.

The investment bank also said the EU emissions trading scheme (ETS), the 27-nation bloc's main policy tool to fight global warming, "isn't working" because carbon prices are "already too low to have any significant environmental impact."
UPDATE 3-UBS analysts predict 70 pct collapse in EU CO2 prices

Fri Nov 18, 2011 3:24pm GMT

* UBS says EU CO2 price call fall to 3 eur/t
* Deutsche Bank cuts 2011 EUA price outlook 25 pct to 9 eur/t
* UBS says oversupply in market won't disappear until 2025
* UBS says carbon scheme "isn't working" (Releads, adds CMIA response paragraph 6-8)

By Jeff Coelho

LONDON, Nov 18 (Reuters) - European Union carbon prices could shed some 70 percent from current levels, as the bloc struggles with a mounting debt crisis and a glut of supply in the carbon market is unlikely to disappear until 2025, analysts at UBS said.

The investment bank also said the EU emissions trading scheme (ETS), the 27-nation bloc's main policy tool to fight global warming, "isn't working" because carbon prices are "already too low to have any significant environmental impact."

2012 Market trajectory...
Q1/Q2 - 2012 Outlook…
E.ON CEO on EU-ETS:
“Its bust. It is dead”
High-level Stakeholder Conference on the Energy Roadmap 2050
7 Feb 2012
Go to: 3mins 20 sec.
What is the Africa Carbon Forum?
“…the place to discuss the latest development in the carbon market and how the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) and other mitigation mechanisms can be successful in Africa….

“matchmaking and deal facilitation sessions where carbon project developers can showcase their projects to investors and carbon buyers.”
Pure-play carbon credit companies in crisis

MUMBAI: The crash in carbon credit prices globally has served a crushing blow to companies operating in this space in India. Firms, whose business models were based purely on profit from sale of carbon credits, have either closed down or substantially downsized their operations.

A carbon credit is a type of a tradable greenhouse gas emission reduction unit issued to projects under the Kyoto Protocol. One carbon credit is equivalent to one tonne of carbon dioxide (CO2) mitigated. A consultant or a trader usually earns a profit from the sale of carbon credits by a manufacturer. With prices falling from around 10-12 euros per unit six-eight months ago to 3-4 euros today, the consultants' profits have slumped by one-fourth. This has forced some of these companies to down shutters.
(C_2)  
Market Ideologies &  
Maps
1st Research Question: Is the Core Solution Set: \textbf{FAIR?} (Will There Be Justice?)
One of our tools of many…

The Open Graph Viz Platform

Gephi is an interactive visualization and exploration platform for all kinds of networks and complex systems, dynamic and hierarchical graphs.

Runs on Windows, Linux and Mac OS X. Gephi is open-source and free.

Learn More on Gephi Platform »

Download FREE Gephi 0.8 alpha

Release Notes | System Requirements

Features
Quick start
Screenshots
Videos

Gephi has been accepted again for Google Summer of Code 2011! The program is the best way for students around the world to start contributing to an open-source project.

Learn More »
..or justice denied? Case of CA-AB32
Network & Neighborhood of the EU-ETS: Geographic analysis & data visualization
50% of the Certified Emissions Reduction (CERs) credits in the EUETS market held by 9 entities...
After 6 years of CDM (& EUETS--recall previous slide)...

Oligopoly? Carbon Cartel?
...Climate Finance Architecture’(s): Structural Crisis of Climate Capitalism...Stealing...
“If you are going to trade any commodity on the open market, you are creating a profit and loss situation. There will be fraudulent trading of carbon credits…In future, if you are running a factory and you desperately need credits to offset your emissions, there will be someone who can make that happen for you. Absolutely, organized crime will be involved.”

--Peter Younger, Interpol, told Reuters in an interview at a forestry conference in Nusa Dua on the Indonesian island of Bali, 2007
Small Networked Problems: **FRAUD** ↑ as “free” market matures

~$11.5B
"The European Union (EU) Emission Trading System (ETS) has been the victim of fraudulent traders in the past 18 months. This resulted in losses of approximately 5 billion euros for several national tax revenues. It is estimated that in some countries, up to 90% of the whole market volume was caused by fraudulent activities."

Last month E.ON CEO on EU-ETS:

“Its bust. It is dead”

High-level Stakeholder Conference on the Energy Roadmap 2050
7 Feb 2012
Go to: 3mins 20 sec.
(D)
Studying
Civil Society & Social Movement(s)
Responses
Movement(s) Below:

...Across Scales
Strategic/Tactical, Multilateral & Networked
Climate Justice Movements...
Movement(s) Across Scales:
Local, National/Regional Scale(s)
RESEARCH BRIEF

Three-City Survey of African Americans on EPA Regulations, Climate Change and Health
African Americans views in Atlanta, Philadelphia & Cleveland (2011)

**Figure 2.** Views on Global Warming as an Environmental Problem

- Serious Problems Now: 64%
- No Serious Problems: 10%
- Problems in Future: 28%
On Tuesday, February 19, 2008, Environmental Justice (EJ) advocates will gather at 5 locations across California for a 10 a.m. teleconference to discuss the release of *The California Environmental Justice Movement's Declaration Against Use of Carbon Trading Schemes to Address Climate Change*. The Declaration details the environmental justice community’s opposition to the use of carbon trading and offsets because of their failure to achieve actual emissions reductions, the irreconcilable problems with trading experiments and offset use, and because of their inability to cause a timely fundamental change in the way we make and use energy. Rather, EJ advocates are calling for policies that focus on moving the state away from the fossil fuel infrastructure because such fuels are the overwhelming contributor to climate change and have devastating impacts on poor, low-income and communities of color in California and around the world. The coalition supports use of consistent carbon pricing mechanisms such as a carbon fee.

Internationally known environmental expert, Larry Lohman from the U.K., will be on the call from Sacramento. He is a founder of the international Durban Group and editor of *Carbon Trading: A Critical Conversation on Climate Change, Privatisation and Power*, which documents the numerous failures of the EU’s Emissions Trading Scheme (ETS) and oppression in the Global South from the use of carbon offsets. Lohman has stated, “The experience from Europe’s [Emissions Trading Scheme] has been a well-documented disaster. Emissions actually increased, the worst polluters were given the largest windfall profits in record, energy costs for consumers increased, and the use of global ‘offsets’ funded oppressive projects the world over. The U.S. should really learn from Europe’s mistakes. Not copy them.”

Please visit our "Media Page" for a full press packet about the event, and the "Resources" page for our factsheet, *The Cap and Trade Charade for Climate Change*, further background information, and links to relevant articles and websites.
Advancing Climate Justice
A 20th Anniversary National Conference
Hosted by WE ACT for Environmental Justice
January 29 -30, 2009
Fordham University Lincoln Center Campus,
New York City

Conference Blog Site Now Online

Celebrating 20 Years of Environmental Justice!

Advancing Climate Justice: Transforming the Economy, Public Health and Our Environment
A 20th Anniversary National Climate Justice Conference Organized by WE ACT for Environmental Justice

Photo Illustration courtesy of GREENSTREET
A San Francisco superior court judge put California's sweeping plan to curb greenhouse gas pollution on hold, saying the state did not adequately evaluate alternatives to its cap-and-trade program.

Judge Ernest H. Goldsmith said the CARB “failed to consider public comments on the proposed measures before adopting the plan.”

In particular, the judge noted, officials gave short shrift to analyzing a carbon fee, or carbon tax, devoting a “scant two paragraphs to this important alternative” to a market-based trading system in their December 2008 plan.
Resistance continues...

November 17, 2011

Request for Support to Fight Offset Loophole in California’s AB 32 Program
Proposed Legal Challenge to AB 32 GHG Offset Regulations and Protocols

Introduction and Contact Information

The purpose of this memorandum is to invite additional groups to participate in a proposed legal challenge by Citizens Climate Lobby ("CCL"). CCL plans to challenge recently adopted regulations and protocols for the use of greenhouse-gas ("GHG") offsets by the California Air Resources Board ("CARB"). These regulations and protocols are part of CARB’s implementation of what is often referred to as “AB 32,” California’s Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006. We explain why such a challenge is appropriate and why it could be powerful in
...as WCI collapses

U.S. States quit Western Climate Initiative
November 18, 2011

New alliance of Canadian provinces and U.S. states will allow more freedom to choose emission reducing policies and programs based on individual priorities.

GLOBE-Net, November 17, 2011 - Six US states have now entirely dropped out of the Western Climate Initiative (WCI), leaving California as the only participating US state.

The formal withdrawals come only days after WCI announced the formation of a non-profit organization to administer the WCI greenhouse gas cap-and-trade program and service its technical needs. (See GLOBE-Net article "Western Climate Initiative Creates Non-Profit Corporation")

Only California of the US and four Canadian provinces - British Columbia, Manitoba, Ontario and Quebec - remain with the proposed carbon trading initiative.
Multilateral & Global Scale(s)

Climate Justice Movements
The Alternative NGO Tendency...Emergence of Climate Justice Now! - CJN!
Den Haag to Bali, Poznan CPH, Cancun & Beyond
COCHAMBRA +1
Climate Justice and Ecological Alternatives
April 15th, 16th and 17th, 2011
at UQAM, Pavilion F.R. DeSève, local DS-RS10
320, Ste-Catherine St. Est, in Montreal

An international conference on:
- Mobilizing against the effects of shale gas exploration and the tar sands;
- Transition towards a carbon-free economy and industrial conversions;
- Ecological crises and people's alternatives:
  in short, a moment to build a climate justice movement!

With:
- Pablo Solon
  Bolivian ambassador to the United Nations and initiator of the World People's Conference on Climate Change in Cochabamba
- Maude Barlow
  World-renowned activist on the right to water and Chairperson of the Council of Canadians
- André Bélisle
  President of the Quebec Coalition Against Atmospheric Pollution
- Judy Rebick
  Founding publisher of Rabble.ca and author of Transforming Power: From the Personal to the Political.
- Also: Amir Khadir, Patrick Bond, Daniel Breton, Clayton Muller Thomas, Ian Angus, Vinod Raina, Claude Génier, Pat Mooney, Dale Marshall, Ellen Gabriel, Eric Darier, Tony Clarke, Jacques Létourneau, John Cartwright, Judith Marshall, Louise Casselman, Michel Ducharme, Ugo Lapointe, Nick De Carlo, Cy Gonick, Roger Rashid, ... and YOU!

Simultaneous translation in English and French for all events.

Price: $10 for the entire weekend!
PART I

Achieving low carbon economies, without resorting to offsetting and false solutions such as nuclear energy and "clean coal", while protecting the rights of those affected by the transition, especially workers.

· Keeping fossil fuels in the ground.

· Implementing people's food and energy sovereignty.

· Guaranteeing community control of natural resources.

· Re-localisation of production and consumption, prioritising local markets

· Full recognition of Indigenous Peoples, peasant and local community rights,

· Democratically controlled clean renewable energy.

· Rights based resource conservation that enforces indigenous land rights and promotes peoples sovereignty and public ownership over energy, forests, seeds, land and water

· Ending deforestation and its underlying causes.
RADICAL NEW AGENDA NEEDED TO ACHIEVE CLIMATE JUSTICE
Climate Justice Now! Network Principles
(Bali, Copenhagen…)

PART II

· Ending excessive consumption by elites in the North and in the South.

· Massive investment in public transport

· Ensuring gender justice by recognising existing gender injustices and involving women in decision making.

· Canceling illegitimate debts claimed by northern governments and IFIs. The illegitimacy of these debts is underscored by the much greater historical, social and ecological debts owed to people of the South.
climate justice or corporate power?

the heat is on!

Conference of the Parties 17
Durban, SA 28 Nov–9 Dec 2011

Instead of the elites’ harmful COP 17, join us at CCS, SDCEA, groundWork and other Climate Justice Now! sites
(1) Diakonia faith/justice centre
(2) BAT cultural centre
(3) beachfront mass assembly area
(4) entrance to biggest port in Africa
(off map: Bisasar Road Clean Development Mechanism dump and Inanda Dam survivors)

stay tuned for Durban climate justice hosting and Reality Tour announcements, Feb 2011:

refinery at notorious South Durban petro-chem complex

South Durban Community Environmental Alliance (SDCEA) provides ‘Toxic Tours’ of CO2 sites in communities around SA’s main petrochemical nexus
Durban’s Conference of Polluters (COP17): what will happen from 28 Nov until 9 Dec?

UNFCCC negotiations
UN & Durban officials want only ‘civilised’ society in (closed) Exhibition Centre
Civil society unity for Durban Univ of Technology alternatives summit
Released in Addis Ababba in April...
The Growing Justice Chorus at COPs…

At Cancun:
CJN! coalition numbers more than 900 organizations; (2X C.A.N.)

By Durban:
10,000 strong March for “climate justice”
Jamming the COP…

official SA logo and slogan:
working together
Saving Tomorrow Today

revised evidence-based logo, slogan:
warming together
Stealing Tomorrow Today
Rise of the Serious-Not Serious

vs. old North-South/Rich-Poor:
Post-Cochabamba
Movement Coherence, Resistance, Agitation

“...writing to inform you of a policy shift that has taken place within Friends of the Earth International from a blanket rejection of offsetting to a blanket rejection of all forms of carbon trading [false solutions].” -- 26 July 2010, Coordinator Climate Justice and Energy Program
The Next COP…?

• Session of the UNFCCC Conference of the Parties in Doha, Qatar, December 2011 – (Energy Minister/Former PM to Chair)

• So far, one preparatory meeting scheduled (May, not June, avoid Rio+20 conflict)

• Parties will provide submissions in the first half of the year on clarifying their pledges, ambition, markets, the transparency provisions, planning of the Durban Platform work program, etc.

• Stand up the Adaptation Committee, the Green Climate Fund, Adaptation, etc.
Beyond the COPs…?

Toward Rio+20

• Domestic Side:
  – Fossil Fuel Shift/Kill… (‘Oil in the Soil’ (Ecuador); ‘Coal in the Hole’ (US); ‘Tar-sands in the Land’ (Can.))
  – Increasing Efficiency Standards
  – $$$ & scale for “green jobs/economy” (Rio+20)

• Multilateral/Bilateral Side:
  – Short-term Forcers Agreement: (Soot, Trop. Ozone & Methane - J. Topping)
  – New Finance (Beyond GCF Negotiations)
  – China ($47.4B ) vs. US ($55.9B) • State Renewable Investment, 1st since 2008.
THANKS!

PLEASE BE IN TOUCH...

Dr. Michael Dorsey, Dartmouth College, ENVS

michael.dorsey@dartmouth.edu


